

## **City of Dunkirk Planning Board Meeting Minutes**

**May 31<sup>st</sup>, 2017**

**Present:** John Mackowiak, Ed Schober, Andy Bohn and Frank Torain. Also present: Rebecca Yanus (Director of Development) Edward Hayes (Recording Secretary), Todd Ellman – Ellman’s Garage, Bill Gugino – Erie Land Development, Mark Baerwaldt – Erie Land Development, Bridget Mackowiak, Valerie Mackowiak and Nicole Gugino – Observer.

**Absent:** Chris Piede

Meeting was called to order by John Mackowiak at 5:33p.m. located in the Mayor’s Conference Room, in City Hall. A quorum was present.

**Acceptance of meeting’s minutes:** Andy Bohn made a motion to accept the minutes of April 26<sup>th</sup>, 2017 seconded by Frank Torain. Carried, all voting aye.

**Communications from the Public and Petitions:** None

**Old Business:** None

***New Business:***

Site Review – Three (3) Bay Carwash - East Doughty Street (Corner of Bucknor & Doughty Streets) - Todd Ellman

Edward Hayes introduced Todd Ellman and stated the Zoning Board of Appeals granted him permission to construct a 3 Bay Carwash on corner of Bucknor and Doughty with the Zoning Board’s stipulations included in the Planning Board packets. Todd Ellman said 2 automatic car wash bays and 1 self-service bay and explained construction design similar to Vineyard Drive facility. Todd Ellman explained cars would enter and exit off Bucknor Street. Todd Ellman explained customers would be making left hand turns and as close to Bucknor Street as he can get it. Will allow for room to enter and exit streets safely. Hours will be 7:00am to 10:00pm. Building is 66’ by 36’ feet chemicals and machinery will be kept in center of facility.

Frank Torain asked if the carwash will be touchless. Todd Ellman said that yes, both automatic washes are touchless and that he doesn’t like brushes because they can sometimes cause damage. John Mackowiak asked about open space on property to move snow/debris in winter. Todd Ellman explained he bought more property in the Town of Dunkirk to move his older vehicles to free up space for the carwash. Todd explained how his cars end up at property from totals, impounds and vehicles that can’t be salvaged.

John Mackowiak asked about green space on the Doughty Street side. Todd Ellman responded that he will keep a strip of grass and shrubs on the Southside next to sidewalk. Todd also explained that he will have an egress on the North side for cars to leave if they need to. He also stated that the exit will come out on the apron not into the street and there will be heated concrete in these areas. Frank Torain asked about doors. Todd Ellman explained overhead doors will come down when inclement weather and when closed. John Mackowiak asked about attendant working and Todd stated that they will have an attendant working at all times of business hours.

Ed Schober commented on the Zoning Boards stipulation for 8' sound proof fencing on the North and East side of the property. Andy Bohn asked about existing fence. Todd Ellman said the existing fencing is 4' and was put up by neighbors. Todd said he was thinking of a nice solid vinyl fence to help with privacy and noise and requires little maintenance and also explained that customers' headlights will always be facing garage and not neighbors.

Todd Ellman commented that any signage will meet City code requirements. John Mackowiak asked about storm drainage Todd Ellman said he meet with the City engineer and the carwash will tie into the waterline and waste line on Bucknor. John Mackowiak stated they will have to run the carwash run off in to the storm drain and not the sanitary line and he would like that state in the resolutions. Todd Ellman said he will be using all concrete on the property and not blacktop and help with drainage. Andy Bohn stated that there is language in the Zoning Board that the carwash will meet City code.

John Mackowiak asked if Todd considered going with 2 bays instead of 3 bays. Mr. Ellman said he originally was going to do 4 bays but the designer suggested that 3 bays would work best for the spacing needs. Frank Torain said he likes the self service option because some people prefer that and won't come if they don't have that option.

Andy Bohn made a motion to accept the application for approval based on the Zoning Board of Appeals stipulations as well as added language on proper drainage to storm drain and was seconded by Frank Torain. Carried, Ed Schober, Andy Bohn and Frank Torain voting aye, John Mackowiak voted no.

Edward Hayes thanked Mr. Ellman for his time and explained he should connect with the City Building & Zoning Officer to obtain the proper permits and submit final architect specs.

#### Preliminary Site Review – 469 Lake Shore Drive East (Villa's at Battery Point) – Bill Gugino & Mark Baerwaldt – Lake Erie Development Corporation

Edward Hayes explained that the next presentation will be on the Battery Point Villas project to be located at 469 Lake Shore Drive East in the City. The Zoning Board of Appeals granted permission to move forward with the project and that Bill Gugino and Mark Baerwaldt were here today to review the preliminary plans for the project to get Planning Board input before they finalize their stamped architectural drawings. Edward Hayes stated there would be no vote on the plans today just a conversation.

Rebecca Yanus introduced Bill Gugino and Mark Baerwaldt of the Lake Erie Development Corporation. Bill Gugino described the project as purchase of 31 acres from Lake Shore Drive to Lake Erie Shore. The project would be done in three (3) phases with the first phase to be market-rate apartment units on the front of the property. 8-unit buildings with garages and provided preliminary specs to the Board. Bill Gugino stated there is a small portion of the property that is designated as wetlands and he is working with a wetlands specialist to mitigate this to another portion of the property. Apartment area would not be impacted by the wetland area.

Bill Gugino said there is a need for new housing in the area with Athenex coming and the lack of new housing stock and market rate apartments in the City. Bill Gugino said they have investigated the market and there is a definite need for the apartments, townhouses and single-family homes. Bill said he is working with the City to look at extending the bike path out to the Battery Point property. Ed Schober said this is a great idea. Andy spoke about the connections that currently exist in that neighborhood that could be utilized.

Andy Bohn asked about the main entrance area and the paper streets that exist adjacent to the property. Bill Gugino stated that Pine Street would most likely never be opened up but possible at Cedar Street or at the end of Otter Street.

Andy Bohn asked about the drainage issues behind the homes on Otter Street. Bill Gugino explained the drainage pipe on Cedar Street is filled with sludge and the ditching near Pine Street will need work. John Mackowiak asked about the water flowing from development on his property to residence properties on Otter and Ounce Street. (Photos of the surrounding properties were circulated by Valerie and Bridget Mackowiak showing the water pooling in the area.) Ed Schober stated that he does not feel this will be an issue because development will have to allow for storm water management as well as use bioswales and rain gardens and would think the developers will have to deal with the storm water on site. Frank Torain asked about City involvement and Rebecca stated that the City would need to look at the engineering to link into the existing infrastructure.

Mark Baerwaldt commented that the initial designs are for the apartments and the rest will be driven by the market and future plans would look at including a community building, swimming pool and recreation center for residents. Frank Torain commented that he sees the value as being more than just Dunkirk and likes the project phasing concept. Rebecca Yanus commented that this could also attract master's students from Fredonia University. Mark Baerwaldt stated that Lake Erie is key and there has been no new market rate development in the City since the Chadwick Bay Lofts and he referenced other properties they have developed successfully.

John Mackowiak asked about privacy for neighbors and the possibility of a fence. Bill Gugino said they could do that. Ed Schober asked about keeping the tree lines. Mr. Gugino said they could do that. It was also suggested to keep the neighborhood open to the existing neighborhoods and just enhance with landscaping. Frank asked about the existing wetland. Bill Gugino stated you can plant & add benches to keep it as an open space area for residents you just can't change the topography of the space.

Bill Gugino explained that the apartments will have their own entrances and four stairways for private entrances. He also stated that the location is very unique because you are living in a rural setting with the City within walking distance. Mr. Gugino commented that they are planning or breaking ground this fall and are finalizing their SEQR and engineering plans and will input the Planning Board's suggestions and return shortly to submit their stamped plans for final Planning Board approval.

Andy Bohn made a motion for adjournment at 6:48 p.m., seconded by Ed Schober. Carried, all voting aye.

The next meeting is: **To Be Determined**