

CITY OF DUNKIRK
COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT BLOCK GRANT
5th PROGRAM YEAR CAPER (2012)

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The City of Dunkirk began receiving funds from the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD) through its Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) entitlement program in 1994. This annual formula-based funding is intended to assist the City of Dunkirk in developing a viable urban community by providing decent housing, a suitable living environment and expanding economic opportunities, principally for persons of low and moderate income (LMI).

While the city recognizes that there are still many barriers to overcome, it is excited about continuing to tackle many of the priority goals and objectives identified in its five year CDBG Consolidated Plan and working towards improving the overall quality of life for all residents of the City of Dunkirk.

GENERAL QUESTIONS

1. Assessment of the one-year goals and objectives

The City of Dunkirk had a very unique, yet challenging year in 2012. 2012 brought on a brand new Mayor, three new council members, and a new Director of Development. The City received information in April of 2012 that its 2012 allocation was being denied due to certain projects being over funded. The City redid their planning, including public hearings, meetings and discussions with HUD. City Council finally approved the PY2012 Annual Action Plan in September, 2012. Funds were not received until October 30, 2012.

In previous years, the City has had too many projects. Within those public hearings, meetings and discussions with HUD, the City drastically cut their projects from 2011 from 23 to 12. Because this was still part of the City's 2008-2012 Con Plan, those goals were laid out in this plan. That being: economic development and housing.

Throughout the first half of 2012, the City of Dunkirk was being audited by the New York State Comptrollers' office. During this time, the City realized it has some issues with its CDBG program, as well as the Dunkirk Local Development Corporation. The DLDC receives CDBG funds for economic development from the City of Dunkirk. Knowing there were issues with the program, the City went to seek out professional help to fix some of these issues. H. Sicherman and Co was the preferred independent consultants that the City hired to consult and fix some of the problems. From September to the present, Harry Sicherman and his associates have been working thoroughly with the Department of Development, Common Council and Mayor on correcting these issues.

From 2009-2011, the City administered its own housing rehabilitation program. Although run efficiently, it was deemed too time consuming for the small office of two. The City went out to RFP for a more professional housing rehabilitation agency. The City selected Chautauqua Opportunities. Because this was done so late in the season, no housing rehabilitation was actually done in 2012, but money is allocated towards rehabbing housing in 2013.

**CITY OF DUNKIRK
COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT BLOCK GRANT
5th PROGRAM YEAR CAPER (2012)**

In 2012, the City kind of “started over” its CDBG program. All sub-recipient agreements were redone to better fit HUD standards. No sub-recipient money was ever given to any agency in 2012. Because of the City and more specifically, the Department of Development focusing on many pas issues, only few projects were funded and completed.

2012 became a challenging, and unique year in PY2012. With a focus of moving forward, it became challenging when so many past issues needed to be corrected. Because of this, a lot of money was not spent in PY2012. Below are the projects, with goals and objectives.

<u>Activity/Project</u>	<u>Description</u>	<u>Funding Amount</u>	<u>Sub-recipient</u>	<u>Status</u>	<u>Accomplishments</u>
Administration/City Employees	Money was allocated towards City salaries that worked directly on CDBG. There was a large focus by many City employees to work on these issues	\$70,000	-	Closed	Although not fully completed, many past issues have been cleared up, and/or are being worked on and will be completed soon.
Administration/Travis Gordon	Travis Gordon worked on the City’s 5-year consolidated plan	\$5,000	-	Open	The plan is currently waiting its 30 day public comment period. It will be sent to HUD by July 31, 2013.
Administration/H Sicherman	Harry Sicherman was brought it to help fix some of the issues and concerns by noth the NYS Comptroller’s office and HUD.	\$15,000	-	Open	Although not fully completed, many past issues have been cleared up, and/or are being worked on and will be completed soon.
Code Enforcement/Wendy Spinuzza	Code Enforcement officer sites all housing violations within the City’s target area	\$20,000	-	Closed	In PY2012, 1,250 violations. 795 of those were corrected and complied. 455 are pending. New in 2012, the Code Enforcement office were have a closer contact with the Department of Development and Chautauqua Opportunities to better correct these violations.
Economic Development/Nicole Waite	Nicole Waite was hired by the DLDC to fix some of the	\$20,000	DLDC	Open	Nicole has successfully made the DLDC more compliant with issues, more specifically, HUD

**CITY OF DUNKIRK
COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT BLOCK GRANT
5th PROGRAM YEAR CAPER (2012)**

	current, DLDC/CDBG issues				compliances. She has worked on HUD loans and Grants. She has also worked on other DLDC projects including the Bertges Building, Flickinger Building and The Clarion Hotel.
Economic Development/Rookies	Rookies received a \$1,600 façade grant for a new sign at their new location on Lake Shore Drive	\$1,600	DLDC	Closed	Rookies received a grant and has hired people since receiving grant.
Economic Development/Dunkirk Pediatrics	Dunkirk Pediatrics received a grant for some work at their new location on Main St	\$1,463.80	DLDC	Closed	Dunkirk Pediatrics received grant and has hired people since receiving grant.
Economic Development/P&G Foods	P&G Foods received a grant for some work at their new location on Central Ave	\$1,429.70	DLDC	Closed	P&G Foods received grant and has hired people since receiving grant.
Economic Development/Medicor	Medicor received a grant for some work at their new location on Central Ave	\$3,000	DLDC	Closed	Medicor received grant and has hired people since receiving grant.
Economic Development/Bertges Building	Annual payment on property purchased by the DLDC in 2009	\$52,678.32	DLDC	Closed	This was the annual payment on the Bertges Building. In 2012, the preferred developer pulled out of the project, however, cleanup was done on the site. Currently, the former car dealership is fully cleaned up.
Parking Facilities	Repairing Senior Center Parking Lot	\$2,500	-	Open	Much needed repairs were made to the Dunkirk Senior Center parking lot. Many seniors have trouble walking, some have canes or wheelchairs. Potholes needed to be fixed to prevent and accidents.
Sidewalk Improvements	ADA curbcuts in the City's target area	\$3,728.25	-	Closed	2 corners at a school received new curbcuts to make it ADA accessible.

**CITY OF DUNKIRK
COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT BLOCK GRANT
5th PROGRAM YEAR CAPER (2012)**

					This occurred in the City's target area at Second Street and Brigham Rd.
Youth Services/Camp Bussing	Bussing was provided for low-moderate income children to camp.	\$6,250.00	-	Closed	Nearly 250 kids received this benefit of bussing. Because of the CDBG allocation, camp costs were kept down, which helped more kids attend this 5-week summer camp.

2. Describe the manner in which the recipient would change its program as a result of its experiences.

The City has made drastic changes, and will continue to make more. The City has learned from previous mistakes and has made the proper adjustments. We have reduced the number of projects in half. We looks reducing that even more in 2013. Few projects will result in more time concentrated on each project. The City has given their housing rehab money to Chautauqua Opportunities. This will also help the Department of Development. The City will work on now just fewer projects, but easier projects to maintain. More public works projects instead of public services projects would also be crucial in the City's efforts to make this a more efficient program.

New sub-recipient agreements are being worked on. These agreements were spell out everything more clear to them, and what the City is looking for. Each sub-recipient will better understand what the City wants, and what HUD wants. This will help with monitoring. The City will make CDBG a more focal point of the Department of Development. This may include staffing changes.

The City will also get better involvement from City Council, the Mayor's office and the public on decisions, especially in the 5-year plan.

Affirmatively Furthering Fair Housing:

The City has reached out and now has better relationships with all housing agencies; Chautauqua Opportunities, CHRIC and the Dunkirk Housing Authority. This will benefit everyone involved with better collaboration.

3. Describe Other Actions in Strategic Plan or Action Plan taken to address obstacles to meeting underserved needs.

The City allocated, but did not spend money on housing and job training. Not only was rehab money allocated, but down payment assistance. Money will help 5 families purchase their first home.

Money has also been allocated to Literacy Volunteers and Chautauqua Works for job training, literacy training and job placement.

5. Leveraging Resources

Program Name	Leverage Resource	Total Project Cost
--------------	-------------------	--------------------

**CITY OF DUNKIRK
COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT BLOCK GRANT
5th PROGRAM YEAR CAPER (2012)**

Chautauqua Opportunities	Owner Contribution, Weatherization Grant, NYSERDA	\$190,650
Street Improvements	NYS CHIPS Program	\$524,000

MANAGING THE PROCESS

1. Describe actions taken during the last year to ensure compliance with program and comprehensive planning requirements.

The City has made correcting issues and becoming compliant a top priority. It has been all hands on board from all employees involved. Independent contractors were also brought in to repair some problems, and to train City personnel on HUD and CDBG rules and regulations.

The City has reduced its projects in half in 2012 to make things run more smoothly. The City has also been more proactive in choosing projects, and talking and working with other department heads.

The City is working on choosing more *black and white* projects. The City has made the public and sub-recipients more clear on which types of projects are acceptable and which ones would be ineligible. Understanding CDBG better has made this easier.

CITIZEN PARTICIPATION

The 2012 public participation portion of the City of Dunkirk's FY2012 CDBG process was a meeting held in the Mayor's Conference Room at City Hall as well as one at the Courtney Street Apartments Community Center in the City of Dunkirk. Meetings also took place at Washington Park, and the SUNY Fredonia Incubator. Citizen participation was also prompted by legal notices of processes, holding more than one public hearing and encouraging written and verbal responses to the programs planned.

The FY 2007 CAPER was available for public comment starting July 15, 2013. There were two legal notices run in the Observer newspaper. At this time the City of Dunkirk has not received any public comments on the FY 2013 CAPER. Attached is a copy of the Legal Notice that was published in the Observer.

INSTITUTIONAL STRUCTURE

1. Describe actions taken during the last year to overcome gaps in institutional structures and enhance coordination.

The Department of Development works closely with the Mayor, Common Council, City Attorney, City Treasurer and Fiscal Affairs officer to better administer the program. The Department of Development has also begun to work more closely with the Public Works office, Recreation and the Building and Zoning office. Although interoffice cooperation has been key, responsibilities for each City staff have become more clear and defined.

**CITY OF DUNKIRK
COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT BLOCK GRANT
5th PROGRAM YEAR CAPER (2012)**

MONITORING

1. Describe how and the frequency with which you monitored your activities.

The City will have a better monitoring process in 2013. No money was allocated yet from PY2012 to any sub-recipients. Once the new agreements are drawn up, the monitoring process will be spelled out more clearly, and will happen more frequent than the past.

2. Describe the results of your monitoring including any improvements.

The City will have a better monitoring process in 2013. No money was allocated yet from PY2012 to any sub-recipients. Once the new agreements are drawn up, the monitoring process will be spelled out more clearly, and will happen more frequent than the past.

3. Self Evaluation

The City will have a better monitoring process in 2013. No money was allocated yet from PY2012 to any sub-recipients. Once the new agreements are drawn up, the monitoring process will be spelled out more clearly, and will happen more frequent than the past.

LEAD-BASED PAINT

1. Describe actions taken during the last year to evaluate and reduce lead-based paint hazards.

All work with CDBG funds in the City will meet HUD regulations. No work has been done, but the City's new housing rehab agency knows these regulations.

HOUSING NEEDS

1. Describe Actions taken during the last year to foster and maintain affordable housing.

The City has allocated \$18,000 for homeownership down payment assistance. Administered by Chautauqua Opportunities, 5 families will receive down payment assistance. \$100,000 was set aside for housing rehabilitation in 2012 as well.

BARRIERS TO AFFORDABLE HOUSING

1. Describe actions taken during the last year to eliminate barriers to affordable housing.

The City has allocated \$18,000 for homeownership down payment assistance. Administered by Chautauqua Opportunities, 5 families will receive down payment assistance. \$100,000 was set aside for housing rehabilitation in 2012 as well.

**CITY OF DUNKIRK
 COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT BLOCK GRANT
 5th PROGRAM YEAR CAPER (2012)
 HOME/AMERICAN DREAM DOWN PAYMENT INITIATIVE (ADDI)**

N/A

HOMELESS NEEDS

- 1. Identify actions to help homeless person make the transition to permanent housing and independent living.**

The City now has a better relationship with Chautauqua Opportunity and the Dunkirk Housing Authority to fix this problem. This is an ongoing issue and one that the City takes very serious.

- 2. Identify new Federal resources obtained from Homeless SuperNOFA**

Chautauqua Opportunities, a sub-recipient of the City’s CDBG program normally received a grant for this.

SPECIFIC HOMELESS PREVENTION ELEMENTS

- 1. Identify actions taken to prevent homelessness**

The City now has a better relationship with Chautauqua Opportunity and the Dunkirk Housing Authority to fix this problem. This is an ongoing issue and one that the City takes very serious.

EMERGENCY SHELTER GRANTS (ESG)

N/A

COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

- 1. Assessment of Relationship of CDBG Funds to Goals and Objectives**

The chart below demonstrates how the CDBG activities for the year 2006 have correlated with the City of Dunkirk’s 2003-07 Consolidated Plan and its priorities and objectives/goals.

Projects/ Activities	Consolidated Plan Priorities	Consolidated Plan Objectives and Goals	Benefit Extremely Low-Income (ELI); Low-Income (LI); Moderate-Income (MI)	Goal Meets Affordable Housing
Owner-Occupied Rehabilitation	Housing Priority #2 – Restore & Strengthen Neighborhoods (pg. 65)	Objective: Rehabilitate substandard owner-occupied housing (pg. 65)	ELI LI	Yes
Code Enforcement	Housing Priority #2 – Restore and Strengthen Neighborhoods (pg. 65)	Objective: Utilize targeted Code Enforcement to preserve neighborhoods (pg. 65)	N/A	N/A

**CITY OF DUNKIRK
COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT BLOCK GRANT
5th PROGRAM YEAR CAPER (2012)**

		66)		
Economic Development	Development Priority #2 – Support Business Growth and Job Creation (pg. 60)	Objective: Be positioned to assist city businesses with growth potential (pg. 60) Objective: Support existing and new businesses in the downtown area (pg. 60) Objective: Make the DLDC an effective agent for the City for business and industrial expansion (pg. 62)	LI MI	N/A
Summer Youth Camp Trans.	Development Priority #4 – Improve the Quality of Life (pg. 63)	Objective: Develop needed Youth programming and facilities (pg. 63)	ELI LI MI	N/A

2. Changes in Program Objectives

There have not been any changed in program objectives in PY2012

3. Assessment of Efforts in Carrying Out Planned Actions

There has been a huge effort in carrying out the Action Plan. However, most money has not been spent. This has made it much easier to carry out projects that we have done.

4. For funds Not Used for National Objectives.

Roughly \$85,000 has been spent in non National Objective projects. This has gone toward administration costs, including salaries for City staff working directly on CDBG, work towards the City’s 5-year plan and our independent consultant. \$30,000 was set aside for spot demolition; however, those funds were not used yet.

5. Anti-displacement and Relocation-for activities that involve acquisition, rehabilitation or demolition of occupied real property

N/A

6. Low/Mod Job Activities-for economic development activities undertaken where jobs were made available but not taken by low-moderate –income person

Four businesses received grants from PY2012 funds. All four of those businesses created job; two being medical facilities, one a grocery store, and one a bar and grill.

**CITY OF DUNKIRK
COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT BLOCK GRANT
5th PROGRAM YEAR CAPER (2012)**

7. Low/Mod Limited Clientele Activities-for activities not falling within one of the categories of presumed limited clientele low and moderate income benefit.

The City of Dunkirk requires an income eligibility form be filled out and the proper documentation to support the information. Most of the City's sub-recipients will follow this process. Sub-recipient agreements will give clearer information on this when they are produced and signed.

8. Program income received

The Dunkirk Local Development Corporation manages the economic development arm of the City. The DLDC received \$22,250.81 in program income in PY2012.

9. Prior period adjustments-where reimbursement was made this reporting period for expenditures (made in previous reporting periods) that have been disallowed, provide the following information.

N/A

10. Loans & receivables

The Dunkirk Local Development Corporation manages the economic development arm of the City. Funds have been allocated in the past, and in 2012 for economic development projects. Currently, there were five loans that were funded with CDBG money, and another three that are partial loan/partial grant. The loan stipulations go into effect in late 2013. Of the five loans, two are current, and one just finished paying off the balance.

11. Lump sum agreements

N/A

12. Housing Rehabilitation-for each type of rehabilitation program for which projects/units were reported as completed during the program year

The City did not do any housing rehabilitation in PY2012

13. Neighborhood Revitalization Strategies

N/A

NON-HOMELESS SPECIAL NEEDS

1. Identify actions taken to address special needs of person that are not homeless but require supportive housing, (including persons with HIV/AIDS and their families).

CDBG funds have not been allocated for any such projects up to now because existing eligible organizations were not ready to use the funding in a timely manner.

**CITY OF DUNKIRK
COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT BLOCK GRANT
5th PROGRAM YEAR CAPER (2012)**

SPECIFIC HOPWA OBJECTIVES

N/A